GRADUATE RECRUITMENT: TEACHING AND OTHER PROFESSIONS

A Research report for the Education Workforce Council

Professor David Egan, Cardiff Metropolitan University

Julia Longville, Cardiff Metropolitan University

Emmajane Milton, Cardiff University

June 2019

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Research Commission

1.1 The Education Workforce Council (EWC) commissioned the Cardiff Partnership (Cardiff Metropolitan University and Cardiff University) to undertake research on what other professions do, in comparison to teaching, to successfully recruit graduates.

1.2 The research was to include consideration of:

- Direct incentives to participate in training and to enter the profession.
- Remuneration and conditions of employment.
- The perceived value of the professionals within society.
- How the profession was promoted/marketed.

Research Methodology

1.3 The methodology for the research agreed with EWC was:

- A review of relevant literature, policy and research evidence.
- Focus Group discussions with undergraduate and current PGCE students.
- Interviews/discussions with professional bodies/representatives in other occupations.

Findings

1.4 Employers who successfully recruit graduates, generally offer a range of incentives including positive career marketing and promotion, an attractive starting salary and conditions of employment, sustained early career induction and support, opportunities, for professional development, 'portfolio career' provision and flexible working arrangements.

1.5 Financial incentives play at most a minimal part within these holistic strategies.

1.6 By comparison recruitment to and retention in teaching in Wales is not supported by a holistic strategy.

1.7 The financial incentives available to assist recruitment to ITE courses do not compensate for the lack of a more holistic approach to recruitment and retention in Wales and on face-value appear to have only had limited impact.

1.8 If learning is to be derived from the experience in other professions, the lack of a holistic workforce strategy for teacher recruitment and retention in Wales is, therefore, a major deficit.

1.9 Given the importance of teacher quality as a determinant of high pupil achievement, unless the issues identified in this report are addressed, it will be difficult for the Welsh Government to achieve its objectives for the education system.

Recommendations

1.10 A holistic workforce (recruitment and retention) strategy for the teaching profession in Wales should be developed.

1.11 If financial incentives were to be part of this strategy, their use should be re-considered.

1.12 As part of the strategy a high-quality promotion and marketing campaign should be developed which counteracts existing negative perceptions of teaching.

1.13 A 3-year *Induction and Early-Career Teacher Development Programme* should be introduced.

1.14 There should be a career-long requirement for teachers to participate in professional learning, including attaining higher-level qualifications.

1.15 Teachers conditions of employment in Wales should address workload, wellbeing, flexible working and career portfolio issues.

1.16 Further research should be commissioned to inform the strategy.

2. INTRODUCTION

The Research Commission

2.1 The Education Workforce Council (EWC) commissioned the Cardiff Partnership (Cardiff Metropolitan University and Cardiff University) to undertake research on what other professions, in comparison to teaching, do to successfully recruit graduates.

2.2 The research was to include consideration of:

- Direct incentives to participate in training and to enter the profession.
- Remuneration and conditions of employment.
- The perceived value of the professionals within society.
- How the profession was promoted/marketed.

Research Methodology

2.3 The methodology for the research agreed with EWC was:

- A review of relevant literature, policy and research evidence.
- Focus Group discussions with undergraduate and postgraduate (Masters and PhD) students and current PGCE (Primary and Secondary) students.
- Interviews/discussions with professional bodies/representatives in other occupations.

Evidence Review

2.4 Various data sources were searched based on:

- defined search terms/syntaxes;
- inclusion and exclusion criteria;
- geographical targeting;
- peer-reviewed publications;
- 'grey' and policy literature.

2.5 The search criteria allowed for intensive searches related to other professions including nursing, social work, other health and care professionals, the police force, law and other industrial sectors including banking, accountancy, engineering and retail. The search criteria allowed for a broad definition of 'incentives' to include professional development and progression as well as financial rewards.

2.6 A range of education, training and social science research databases were searched including:

- *EBSCO.*
- *The Evidence for Policy and Practice Information* (EPPI) Coordinating Centre database.
- *The Evidence for Impact* website which provides a simple evidence rating system for interventions.
- British Education Index (BEI)
- ERIC (Education Resources Information Centre).
- Google Scholar
- Canadian Education
- Academic Search Complete
- Education Source.

Focus Group Discussions

2.7   A series of seven focus groups were set up with undergraduate and postgraduate students at Cardiff University studying a range of subjects, with a dominant focus on shortage subject areas (these included, Welsh, Mathematics, Chemistry, Modern Foreign Languages (MFL), Physics, Computer Sciences and Social Sciences). Students were recruited through convenience sampling via a contact member of staff in the shortage subject areas. These staff members were responsible for the recruitment of the students and drew upon the information sheet provided. In addition two focus groups were conducted with PGCE (Primary and Secondary) students in Cardiff Metropolitan University. All the focus groups were conducted by at least one member of the Cardiff University research team

2.8 Across all the focus groups conducted, there were a total of 54 participants - 33 undergraduate students and 4 postgraduate students who were from the range of subject disciplines in Cardiff University noted above. Of these 5 participants were planning to commence a PGCE in September 2019 – 3 in Primary and 2 in Secondary (Welsh). In addition 17 PGCE students (Primary and Secondary) took part in two focus groups conducted in Cardiff Metropolitan University. These students had first degrees in the following subject specialisms – Primary (Spanish, German, Sport, Education, Inclusive Studies, Film and TV studies and Welsh) and Secondary (Mathematics, Physics, Biomedical Sciences, History, Textiles, Theatre, English, French and Finance).

2.9 The students did not gain anything from their participation in the research and were clear that their participation was purely an opportunity to contribute their views and influence future developments in this area and that their participation would in no way have a positive or detrimental effect on their studies.

2.10 Each focus group had between 2-9 participants and included opportunities for:

- Exploration of what kinds of incentives and disincentives attract(ed) them to potential future careers.
- Perceptions relating to what age/stage is key to making decisions about career aspirations.

- Exploration of what might encourage them to pursue a career in teaching.
- Exploration of what reasons they believe to be barriers to considering a career in teaching.
- Other professions and professional roles that they were considering.

2.11 A series of semi-structured interview questions were developed for use with the focus groups and these were informed by engagement with and a review of key literature. The focus groups were planned and structured to promote dialogue and full participation. They were audio recorded and transcribed ahead of analysis.

Interviews/Discussions

2.12 Either face-to-face or telephone interviews were held with representatives of:

- Social Care Wales
- Health Education Improvement Wales
- The Cardiff NHS Deanery
- Law Society Wales
- Gwent Police
- Higher Education courses for nursing and social work.
- The Financial Services Contact Centre
- Cardiff University Careers Service
- Cardiff Metropolitan University Careers Service.

Research Ethics

2.13 The research methodology was approved by the Cardiff Metropolitan School of Education and Social Policy Research Ethics Committee.

3. GRADUATE EMPLOYMENT: OTHER PROFESSIONS

Overall Profile

3.1   Some overall features of current graduate employment in the UK are set out below (High-Fliers Research, 2019; HECSU, 2018; HESA 2017 and 2018; Fielding, 2019; Greaves, 2018 and 2019).

3.2   Following a drop in graduate recruitment in 2017, believed to have been caused by labour markets uncertainties following the vote to leave the European Union, it increased in 2018 and is expected to rise substantially in 2019. Graduate recruitment experts predict, however, that there is likely to be a dip resulting from a possible post- Brexit recession.

3.3   The biggest increases are in the public sector (particularly nursing), accounting, marketing, professional services and engineering. The most significant fall is in teaching, followed by graphic design, public relations, journalism, youth work and probation.

3.4   One graduate recruitment organisation has identified that the top ten jobs viewed on graduate recruitment websites by undergraduates and recent graduates included the police, social work, child psychologist, accountancy, forensic sciences, teaching assistants and public relations (Fielding, 2019).

3.5   There continues to be a shortage of graduates to fill some employment opportunities, particularly in managerial and professional graduate jobs. In relation to Physics and teaching, for example, even if all the current cohort of Physics graduates were to enter teaching, there would still be significant teacher vacancies Top graduate employers are responding to this in two ways:

•   Through offering paid work experience programmes to undergraduate students and recent graduates as a way of attracting them at the earliest possible opportunity. A third of graduate recruiters indicate that graduates without this type of work experience were unlikely to be successful during the selection processes for employment with their companies.

•   Through IT and Engineering firms targeting Mathematics, Physics and Computer Science graduates and the rapidly growing marketing industry targeting English and Geography graduates.

3.6   The impact of work experience- undertaken during secondary and higher education – was also raised in the focus group discussions with undergraduate students. They believed that these experiences had strongly influenced their thinking about possible future employment opportunities.

3.7   The percentage of graduates who now opt to undertake further study continues to increase with 16.1% of graduates following this route, of whom 60.5% study for a Masters, 10.6% for a Doctorate and 14.7% for a PGCE.

3.8   In recent years significant efforts have been made to address the concept of 'graduate employability' in UK university programmes. The overarching focus has been on developing industry-related employability skills such as communication, team working and self-management which are widely accepted as enhancing graduate employment prospects. It has been argued, however, that graduate employability 'cannot be reduced to a simple formula based upon graduate credentials and employability skills' (Clark, Zukas and Lent, 2011: 148).

3.9   Other academic writing has suggested that students need to be actively participating in their identity development throughout their time at university. They need to learn the complex nature of identity, as well as their own agency in shaping it, and in this way have the best opportunity to become graduates who are ready for the world of work (Chickering & Reisser, 1993). This would suggest that all graduate employers, including the teaching profession, need to look more closely at the point at which students make decisions about their future identity in the workplace and provide well-timed interventions to attract them.

Features of Graduate Employment

Promotion and Marketing

3.10   Whilst it seems that undergraduates begin to explore future career options towards the second year of their undergraduate studies (Fielding, 2019) they will also have received earlier advice during their secondary school education.

3.11   Participants in the focus group discussions spoke of remembering specific careers events and talks that were influential in shaping their thinking about what they might wish to do. There seems to be key points in secondary education at which these experiences inform choices about subjects e.g. Year 9 and Year 11.

3.12   In some cases, these had a notable impact on the options that these students pursued later in their educational careers. Participants were also clear that without exception where they had any kind of careers event or talk these were focused on Science Technology Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) related occupations and/or specific professions e.g. Army.

> *"I don't think we really had that much careers advice, other than being told we should all go into STEM."* MFL undergraduate.

3.13   As a result of both the growth of the graduate sector and, as outlined above, the shortage of graduates, particularly within key growth sectors of the economy and public service, graduate recruitment has become a major industry. Most graduates it seems research future employment options through employment websites and

recruitment agencies and not through university careers services or social media (Greaves, 2018).

3.14   Many public sector professions have responded to the shortages they face in graduate recruitment with high profile marketing and promotion campaigns. An example in Wales is the *'Train, Work, Live'* campaign in the health sector (website). This has been supported by the Welsh Government as part of an intended 'strategic partnership with education providers across Wales at every level from school to university' to ensure that the future employment needs of the health service are seen as an important issue by all Welsh citizens (Welsh Government, 2018c:31).

Salary and Conditions of Employment

3.15   The median graduate starting salary at the leading graduate employers is expected to be unchanged for the fifth consecutive year in 2019 at £30,000. The most generous salaries (up to £47,000) are offered by leading banking, law, consulting, energy and retail companies, many of whom operate graduate schemes to attract the most able candidates who they hope to fast-track into leadership roles.

3.16   The undergraduate students who participated in the focus group discussions acknowledged that whilst many of the career options they were considering had similar starting salaries, securing a job with the highest possible starting salary was an important factor for some of them.

3.17   Examples of the careers they were considering and the respective starting salaries (the starting salary for teaching is £23,720) included:

- Translation - £20,000 (Welsh / MFL focus group)
- Protective Service Officer - £21,000 (Welsh focus group)
- IT consultant - £24,000 (Computer Science focus group)
- Journalism - £25,000 (Welsh focus group)
- Pharmaceutical development analyst - £25,000 (Chemistry graduate)
- Accountancy - £26,000 (Mathematics focus group)
- Data analyst - £26,000 (Computer Science focus group)
- GCHQ - £26,700 (Computer Science focus group)
- Corporate Trader - £28,000 plus bonus (Mathematics focus group)
- Software developer - £31,000 (Computer Science focus group)
- MI5 - £31,000 (Physics focus group)
- Actuary - £32,000 (Mathematics focus group)

- Software engineer - £37,000 (Computer Science focus group)

- Aldi (retail) - £44,000 (various)

- Microsoft Technology Solutions Professional - £50,000+ plus bonus (Chemistry focus group)

3.18   The focus group students were also clear that salary levels were not the only factor they considered *at the time* of making career decisions. Other influences included:

- The need for job security.
- Having a permanent contract.
- Job satisfaction both in terms of 'making a difference' and utilising skills and expertise.
- Ongoing professional learning and support.
- Feeling challenged and stimulated by the role.
- Career prospects.
- Opportunities to travel
- Work/life balance

Incentives

3.19   Most graduate employers (approximately 75%) do not offer differentiated salary entry points based on the level of education qualifications. Those employers who did- such as banking and law- usually provided incentives for qualifications such as MBAs PhD's. Employers did not generally provide additional payment incentives for work experience, with engineering appearing to be an exception to this pattern (BIS, 2015).

3.20   It appears that around 30% of employers offer some form of 'golden hellos' to graduate recruits including relocation packages. This was usually linked to the challenges faced in finding graduates in some geographical areas (BIS, 2015). An example of this in Wales, linked to the shortage of GPs in many parts of Wales, is the financial incentive of £20,000 offered to medical graduates to train within certain health board areas where there has been a five-year history of below average rates of posts being filled (https://trainworklive.wales). To receive the full incentive, GPs must remain in their post for at least one year following training (https://gprecruitment.hee.nhs.uk?recruitment/ters/wales).

3.21   Instances of financial incentives being used to attract social workers are pointed to below, but in general, however, there does not appear to be evidence of financial incentives being used as a feature of graduate recruitment and employment in the public sector including to public sector professions.

3.22   In the focus group discussions with undergraduate students, there was no explicit mention of incentives or 'golden hellos' in any of the types of careers discussed. What was striking, however, was the combined range of considerations that incentivised job choice / career path, which were those listed in 3.18 above.

3.23   Many employers now attempt to attract graduates through emphasising the professional support and development including career progression that will be available to them. This was reflected in the responses made by the undergraduate students who took part in the focus groups. Some participants highlighted that they had been attracted to careers or job roles in which they felt they would be stretched and challenged. This seemed important on two levels, firstly from the perspective of feeling sufficiently stimulated and needing to operate on the 'edge': these participants were conscious of their needs in terms of their own personal growth and satisfaction. Secondly, from the perspective of wanting to feel secure within their job role.

> *''One of the things that drew me to Microsoft is that they have stretch projects, which are projects that you do outside of your day job completely just to help the community to help other people. I do quite a lot of volunteering so being able to combine that and get paid to do it at the same time, brilliant." Chemistry undergraduate.*

3.24   Examples of career progression opportunities offered to new graduate entrants include placing them in a variety of settings and contexts. These are intended to provide a range of experience and to enable them to identify areas where they have special interests. Having a single sector employer, such as is the case with the NHS for example, facilitates this process of developing flexible and attractive career pathways.

3.25   Some of the participants in the undergraduate focus group sessions highlighted that they were attracted to careers or job roles in which they felt there would be explicit and regular opportunities for career progression and promotion.

> *"Prospects, so you've got here chances for promotion… that there's a path. It doesn't necessarily need to be linear, it can be sideways, but to go somewhere and then that have an increase in a title, so status, an increase in salary… and more challenges. Like I guess you don't want to be static, you want to keep moving forward I think… like a shark."*
> *Chemistry undergraduate*

3.26   An interesting example of this type of early career development is provided by the *Financial Services Sector in Wales*. The *Contact Centre* for this sector in Wales has developed a graduate programme that is financially supported by the *European Social Fund.* This began with 4 companies in 2013 and now involves eighteen firms (Interview with Financial Service Contact Centre).

3.27   They recruit 45 graduates every two years who are paid an initial salary of £18,000, move between roles in the different companies and at the same time study for a sector-funded Masters' degree where 100 of the 180 credits are earned through work-based learning. The programme has a 95% retention rate and most of the participants begin to apply for permanent posts halfway through the programme.

3.28   Whilst one of the reasons for developing the programme was to assist the growth of the financial sector in Wales through attracting top graduates from across the UK and Europe, approximately 60% of graduates on the programme are Welsh domiciles. Over 400 applications are received from graduates in a range of disciplines for the 55 places on the programme. A similar scheme for the *Data Science* sector has been developed and is currently working with its first cohort of graduates.

3.29   Joint workforce development is also being pursued in the health and social care sectors in Wales. Following a review commissioned by Welsh Government in 2015 which called for 'a single body for workforce planning, development and commissioning of education and training' (Evans et al, 2015:4) *Health Education Improvement Wales* has been set up and with the already established regulatory body for the social care sector, *Social Care Wales,* is developing a long-term workforce strategy for the medical, clinical and social care sectors in Wales that involves all stakeholders.

3.30   The vision of the 2015 review, which has been taken up by the Welsh Government, is for:

> ''Health Boards and Universities to interact more closely with the education sector to provide meaningful work experience programmes for all school children to enhance awareness of the working of the health and social care system, to instil a degree of pride in the NHS and inspire young people to work in the health system in Wales…'' (Evans et al, 2015: 5).

3.31   The features of graduate employment outlined above are further considered below in three case-studies of public sector professional employment areas in Wales: the police, social work and nursing professions. These examples have been chosen because like teaching they are seen as 'mission-oriented' professions (Besley and Ghatak, 2005) and because they are popular career choices for graduates where some of the same issues faced in teaching are present.

The Police Force

3.32   From 2019 the Police Force is moving to become an all-graduate entry profession. This will encompass three entry and progression routes:

- Graduates (who did not study a first degree in Police Studies) who undertake a full, two-year, training programme.

- Graduates (who will have studied over the next 2/3 years for a first degree in Police Studies) who will undertake a shorter training period.
- Non-graduates who are over the age of eighteen and possess the equivalent of Level 3 qualifications, who undertake a three-year Higher- Level Apprenticeship programme.

3.33   Each police force can decide on the percentage of entrants it takes in via these routes during a recruitment round. In the *Gwent Police Force*, for example, currently approximately 60% is graduate recruitment and the other 40% through the apprenticeship route. The likelihood is that the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner will aim for this to settle to an equal split between these two routes into the future. They believe that this will allow it to better reflect the demography of the area it serves and provide equality of opportunity for young people from these communities to progress to employment in the force.

3.34   In Wales entry is through an all-Wales platform and includes on-line tests, psychometric assessment, an application form and following a sift, successful candidates are invited to a selection centre where they undertake practical scenarios and further skills and competence testing, before a final interview. The graduate route is proving extremely popular with for example, thousands of applicants applying for 50/60 places per year currently in the Gwent force.

3.35   Graduate entrants undertake a two-year training programme (3 years for Apprentices):

- In Year 1 they initially spend 26 weeks in a training school supported by specialist police training officers and a University partner. This is followed by two 12- week placements: the first with a *Tutor Constable* who will provide competence-based mentoring and coaching and the second where the student constable works on their own. Throughout this period the police lead on the practical training aspects and the higher education partner leads on academic assessment.

- In Year 2 the student constable undertakes three additional placements in a variety of settings including road traffic duties, neighbourhood policing and a police protection unit. An individual learning programme is drawn up for them which includes three academic modules.

- Successful graduate trainees receive confirmation of their post and 120 academic credits towards a Masters' degree. Part-funding can then be applied for to enable them to complete the Masters'. Apprentices who successfully complete the first two years undertake a project and dissertation in Year 3 to meet the requirements of their route.

3.36   On entry student constables receive a £20,370 salary and this rises to £25, 728 following successful completion of the two-year training programme. If they succeed

in being appointed to constable level, after 7 years they can earn £36, 885. There are also opportunities for them to apply for fast-track routes to becoming an Inspector within 2 years: this is an elite route which only 1 out of 1330 officers in the force progress to.

3.37   The Police Force has also introduced a direct-entry route for graduates who can proceed straight to constable level and will be encouraged to then fast-track through to Inspector and Superintendent posts. Police Forces must opt into this route and Gwent Police have included this as an entry route, but it is a very small element with only one entrant thus far.

3.38   At this point in the development of the new routes, retention rates are good and generally graduate retention within the police force is at acceptable levels, although the force is aware that 'millennial' entrants do not necessarily think of a thirty-year career followed by a pension as was the case in the past. More generally, it seems that whilst retention rates in the police force are better than in other public sector occupations including teaching, the attrition rate is increasing.

Social Work

3.39   Graduates enter the social work profession via either a 3-year specialist undergraduate programme or, following graduation in other subject disciplines, through a two-year postgraduate programme leading to an MSc award. In 2017, 196 students began the undergraduate programme and 92 the Masters': with an increasing proportion following the latter route (Social Care Wales, 2018). Some of the students applying for the undergraduate programmes also already have first degrees in other subject areas and the average age profile of applicants is 25-30 years old with many older applicants including secondees.

3.40   Bursaries are available to social work undergraduate and postgraduate students in Wales, with postgraduate students receiving £13,280 over the two-year period of their Masters' course. In Wales undergraduate bursaries are available from Year 1 of the 3-year degree whereas in England they are not on offer until Year 2. The number of bursaries available is linked to the training places allocated by Social Care Wales and if the Universities recruit greater numbers they allocate the bursaries in relation to student need. Funding is also provided to local authorities to provide practice opportunities and for students to claim travelling expenses.

3.41   There is not a national salary framework for newly qualified social workers and each local authority determines salary entry points and progression. Current posts advertised by local authorities in Wales suggest that the entry point is £25,000 with progression to £40,000 on this scale.

3.42   Employability rates from these programmes is high and in Wales is assisted by the close involvement of local authorities in organising the work placement programmes, leading to strong relationships being developed which often lead to first employment being with these host local authorities. There has also been a growth in

newly qualified social workers registering with employment agencies as this can allow for flexibility in employment and sometimes financial incentives.

3.43   The profession does not believe, however, that these initial programmes provide the full development of knowledge, values and personal attributes that is required to be an effective social worker.

3.44   Employer-led continuing professional development is, therefore, a requirement of registered social workers. This is achieved through an ongoing *Continuing Professional Education and Learning Framework (CPEL)* which begins with a *First Three Years in Practice Framework*, which all social workers qualifying after April 2016 are required to complete and which consists of:

- Induction (within the first three months of practice).
- An individual plan to support the growth of competence and confidence during the first year of practice.
- A *Consolidation Programme* in the second and third year of practice leading to renewal of registration with the regulatory body.

3.45   The individual plan should include a programme of learning and development, supervision and appraisal, balanced work opportunities which reflect the complexity of practice, mentoring, feedback from people with care and support needs and, finally, confirmation of readiness for the Consolidation Programme.

3.46   The Consolidation Programme is led by two clusters of local authorities in Wales and assessed and accredited by two HEIs and must be successfully completed for the renewal of initial registration as a qualified social worker with fitness to practice (CCSIW and Care Council for Wales, n.d.). This focuses on further developing the knowledge and skills of participants in three key areas (Social Care Wales,n.d):

- Applying analysis during assessments to inform interventions.
- Working collaboratively with people who receive care and support, carers and other professionals.
- Intervening and applying professional judgement in increasingly complex situations.

3.47   Successful completion of the Consolidation Programme can lead to the award of 30 credits at Level 6. Further, non-mandatory, professional development opportunities within the CPEL framework enable experienced practitioners, senior practitioners and consultant social workers to achieve additional academic credit towards a Masters' award. A generally positive independent evaluation of the programme has been produced (Social Care Wales, 2018), although there have been concerns about the non-mandatory elements of the framework and it is currently being reviewed.

3.48   As was seen above, social work is a both a strong area of potential career interest for graduates but also a shortage area. Local authorities in England are

reported to be facing significant challenges in recruiting social workers (particularly children's social workers), unfilled vacancies and a reliance on agency staff. In England this has led to some local authorities offering both 'golden hello' payments for those who are recruited and 'golden handcuff' payments of up to £15, 000 for those who remain in post for at least three years (The Guardian, 2016 and 2019).

3.49   *Social Care Wales* believe that whilst applications to both initial qualifying routes for social workers have been in decline, they are still reasonably popular (with approximately 90% of places filled in the most recent recruitment period). Applications to the Masters' programme have declined to c 170 a year compared to above 400 in the past. Whilst they believe that recruitment to posts is also generally healthy and there appears to be no evidence of financial incentives being offered to assist recruitment, a recruitment campaign '*We Care'* has recently been launched.

3.50   Retention, particularly in areas such as children's services, child protection and mental health, is also a challenge and leads to the need to improve recruitment. One research study, using cross-sectional data from census and labour force surveys, estimated that the average working life for a social worker is under eight years, compared to 16 for a nurse and 25 for a doctor (Curtis et al ,2010). Information for other local government workers such as teachers was not available to provide further comparisons.

3.51   The perception is that rates of retention are higher in Wales than for example, in England and have been strengthened by the development of the graduate and Masters' routes (rather than the previous Diploma in Social Work qualification) and the CPEL framework.

3.52   This has led to increased focus being placed upon retention of staff across the health and social care sector (Moriarty et al, 2018). In Wales, as pointed out above the creation of *Health Education Improvement Wales* and the joint work it is doing with *Social Care Wales* on workforce development is representative of this and has led to the development of the *CPEL* framework.

Nursing

3.53   Nurses are now the single largest group of graduates leaving UK universities each year. In Wales, Welsh-domiciled NHS nursing undergraduate students do not have to pay course fees and – unlike England where they were ended in 2017- are also entitled to apply for bursaries (as nearly all do) receipt of which requires them to work in Wales for two years after qualifying. Despite this ongoing growth, the demand for nurses in the UK continues to outstrip supply, with many unfilled vacancies each year (Greaves, 2019).

3.54   Qualifying to be a nurse in Wales is through undergraduate degree programmes which is heavily work-based with the equivalent of 18 months of full-time work during the three- year programme, leading to registration with the *Nursing and Midwifery Council.*

3.55   Wales was the first part of the UK to educate all its nurses and midwives to graduate level. Career progression pathways allow opportunities to move to clinical nurse specialist roles, advanced nurse practitioner posts and consultant nursing. Leadership pathways allow progression from ward and team leadership to senior nurse positions.

3.56   A registered nurse starts on a salary of £24, 214 rising to £30,112 on the basic band and can rise to £35,577 on becoming a nurse team leader. Ward manager and equivalent salaries range from £31,696 to £69,168. Working conditions allow for a range of innovative arrangements including flexible working hours, childcare voucher schemes, work-life balance initiatives and on-site creche facilities. These have been introduced as part of an increasing focus on the health and wellbeing of the profession and to assist retention of registered nurses in the profession (Adult Nurse Job Profile, 2019).

3.57   The number of nurses, midwives and health-visitors in Wales has grown by almost 8,200 since 1996 and by September 2018 reached a total of 32,927 (Welsh Government, 2019). Because staffing data is held by individual Local Health Boards in Wales, research commissioned by Welsh Government reported in 2015 a 'worrying variety in terms of attempts at comparability and consistency of systems, processes and software packages used to capture and hold staffing information (Welsh Government, 2015: 6).

3.58   Probably for this reason it has been difficult to establish levels and patterns of nurse recruitment and retention in Wales. It is generally believed, however, that nursing is facing retention issues with the proportion of nurses leaving the profession increasing in recent years (NB HIEW are due to get more data to me in June 2019).

3.59   Research has identified that in nursing – as in the police force- that stakeholders who were interviewed wanted tailored career plans including flexible working patterns and 'portfolio' careers if they were to be retained in the profession (Worth et al, 2018).

3.60   It is recognised that early career support for nurses is especially important if they are to be retained in the NHS (Worth et al, 2018). In the best practice situations, newly- registered nurses, therefore, undertake a *preceptorship* programme which provides a period of structured transition when they commence employment. They are supported by an experienced practitioner (a preceptor) who coaches them to become an independent professional through refining their skills, values and behaviours.

3.61   Preceptors are experienced clinicians with high levels of clinical and educational knowledge who teach, mentor, supervise and evaluate students in a professional environment (Latham, Hogan, & Ringl, 2008). Part of this role is a commitment to the demonstration and continuation of competent nursing practices (Faron & Poeltler, 2007).

3.62   Following initial registration nurses in Wales must re-validate their registration every 3 years with the *Nursing and Midwifery Council*. The requirements to be met are:

- 450 practice hours
- 35 hours of continuing professional development
- 5 pieces of practice-related feedback
- 5 written reflective accounts
- Reflective discussion
- A declaration of health and character
- An appropriate indemnity arrangement
- Confirmation of the above from the confirming body (Nursing and Midwifery Council, 2019).

3.63   The career-long commitment to professional development required by this re-validation process includes the mandatory elements and a range of other professional development opportunities offered by the Local Health Board in which they are employed who work with universities in providing these programmes. These professional development opportunities open up pathways for nurses to become an *Advanced Nurse Practitioner*.

3.64   These requirements are supported by the various professional and representative bodies in the medical and social care field including the *Royal College of Nursing* (The Interprofessional CPD and Lifelong Learning UK Working Group, 2019).

3.65   Funding is available through the *Research Capacity Building Collaboration,* which was set up in 2005, to enable both new and experienced nurses to undertake research projects (usually clinical trials) related to their practice. Clinical academic research careers are, however, thought to be relatively underdeveloped in Wales compared to other parts of the UK and funding is seen to be too short-term and largely unsystematic (Council of Deans of Health, 2018).

4. GRADUATE EMPLOYMENT: TEACHING

Overall Profile

4.1   Education remains the most popular employment choice for UK graduates with 37,775 graduates and postgraduates (13.5% of all graduates) entering employment in the sector in 2016/17. After teaching the most popular employment choices for graduates were nursing and midwifery (9.5%) and sales/marketing professionals (7%). In primary (83% compared to 17%) and secondary teaching (64% compared to 36%) the gender profile of new entrants split towards females. 85% of entrants are white and there is a noticeable absence of Black African graduates entering the profession. Graduates with a disability also are significantly under-represented within the UK teaching force. (Hobson, 2019).

4.2   Despite these positive features the UK continues to face severe teaching shortages as a result of difficulties with recruitment and retention. This results in England, for example, in 50% of Physics and 54% of Mathematics secondary school teachers not having a first degree in a subject strongly related to their subject area (Sibieta, 2018). The challenge being faced has been described as follows:

> ''Rising pupil numbers, shortfalls in the number of trainee teachers and concerns about the proportion of teachers who say they are considering leaving the profession means that teacher supply in the state sector is a major policy issue in England. Meeting the current and future demand for teachers across school phases and types, subjects and diverse geographical areas is a complex challenge.''
> (Worth et al, 2018).

4.3   These challenges are more serious in some secondary subject areas than others and more in secondary than primary and are experienced to the greatest extent in areas high socio-economic disadvantage (Sibieta, 2018). Given that we know from extensive research on school effectiveness that within the school system the greatest factor which impacts upon pupil achievement is the quality of teaching, these teacher shortages inevitably impact upon pupil achievement within the education system (Barber and Mourshed, 2007; Chapman et al, 2012).

4.4   These challenges are not unique to the UK. The largest shortage of teachers can be found in developing countries, but there are also growing gaps in Western countries, such as the USA, Ireland, Spain and Sweden (Unesco, 2009). According to Swedish statistics, the educational system will lack roughly 22 000 teachers, approximately 20% of the teaching workforce, by 2020 (Statistics Sweden, 2012; Swedish National Agency for Higher Education, 2012).

4.5   International research on teacher attrition (Borman & Dowling, 2008; Ingersoll, 2001; Luekens et al., 2004, OECD, 2005) suggest that those who are more likely to be "leavers" are female, white, married, working within special education, Mathematics

and Science teachers. The schools they are leaving are often urban or suburban with high enrolments of poor, minority and low-achieving students.

4.6   Wales faces many of the same problems with a recent report finding that 'significant numbers are leaving their training course before its end or during the first three years of their career' and early-career teachers telling the report authors that they wondered' how long they can sustain the level of expectation placed upon them' (Welsh Government, 2018a:22). These are longstanding concerns having been highlighted since devolution by both the *General Teaching Council for Wales* (2002 and 2003) and *Estyn* (2007).

Promotion and Marketing

4.7   Until approximately 5 years ago the responsibility for the promotion and marketing of teaching as a career in Wales was undertaken on behalf of the Welsh Government by the *Teacher Development Agency*. When that contract came to an end, Welsh Government moved this responsibility to the four Regional Education Consortia in Wales, who created a '*Discover Teaching'* promotional website(https://www.discoverteaching.wales hosted by Central South Consortium supported by a range of other activities.

4.8   In the view of the university careers services that were interviewed as part of this research the website, compared to other graduate recruitment portals, was of poor quality and was rarely updated. Crucially not one of the students who participated in the focus group, whether undergraduate, postgraduate or PGCE student, was aware of the website.

4.9   Following a review by Welsh Government, in January 2019 the responsibility for the marketing and promotion of teaching in Wales was moved to the EWC and it is currently developing a two-year plan for consideration by the Welsh Government.

4.10   Given that evidence suggests that the large majority of undergraduates have made decisions about their future careers by the end of their second year in University it is clearly of concern that the promotion and marketing of teaching as a career in Wales in recent years appears to have been in a situation of drift.

4.11   Added to this there appears to be limited liaison between those playing key roles in recruitment to ITE and teaching. The university careers services noted that whilst links existed between some university subject departments and ITE institutions, they had not been systematically developed or sustained, particularly in secondary shortage subject areas.

4.12   Whilst in most graduate employment areas specialist Graduate Employment Fairs were held, this had not been possible for teaching. The lack of involvement of schools, particularly inspirational headteachers and teachers, in the recruitment process was noted and this again compared unfavourably with other professions where practitioner role-models were often involved in the graduate recruitment process.

4.13   Careers staff perceived that a likely consequence of this lack of positive promotion and marketing of teaching was that more negative perceptions of teaching, often conveyed within the media and sometimes transmitted by teachers in schools (in relation to pupil behaviour, teacher workload and high-stakes external accountability) were persuasive.

4.14   The biggest impact of this was being seen in relation to those interested in secondary teaching but was now also apparent in primary teacher recruitment. They compared this to the attractiveness of the graduate schemes being offered to undergraduate students and stressed that this was not an issue about salaries or money, but about a perception of the profession and the opportunities offered for progression.

4.15   Research evidence suggests that there also issues about the extent to which university undergraduate programmes prepare students for careers such as teaching through developing their own personal and professional identities (Crebert, Bates, Bell, Patrick, & Cragnolini, 2004). Given that university tutors have a vested interest in ensuring that prospective students have positive experiences in their secondary education, the research suggests that they could provide more support and encouragement to attract graduates into teaching.

4.16   Participants in the focus groups could not remember any events in their time in secondary schools where teaching had been promoted as a possible career option. When in higher education, a small number of participants had found out about *Teach First* through promotional 'pizza nights' aimed at attracting potential applicants. Those who were aware of *Teach First* generally held a less positive view of it as a route into teaching and believed that it had problems with retention rates.

4.17   A few students mentioned experiences as part of their undergraduate programmes where they had studied a module, which was credit bearing, and which involved 'working' in school as a teaching assistant sharing their subject expertise and therefore having the opportunity to consider a career in teaching in a more authentic way. This was regarded as highly valued by those who had experienced it and was envied by participants who hadn't had a similar opportunity.

> *'It just like inspired me, I was like that's the sort of teacher I'd want to be is be like him. And like he's still at the school now and he's still supporting me… he wrote me a reference, he still asks me how I'm doing." Social science undergraduate.*

4.18   One of the university careers services interviewed supported this perspective based on the evidence of their 'Classroom Experience Project' which results in approximately 100 students each year undertaking voluntary work placements in local schools.

4.19   A handful of focus group students mentioned experiences at open days, interview/selection days and the perception held by some teachers of the variety of ITE undergraduate and PGCE courses available in Wales. They reported that the variability in quality was evident and that teacher training qualifications from some specific providers were much more sought after by schools than others.

> *"Some students started [at another provider] but left after two weeks and moved to another provider because of its good reputation." PGCE Secondary student.*

> *"There's limited support in some providers, especially if you're placed in a challenging school with bad behaviour." Social science undergraduate.*

4.20   Focus group students raised some concerns specifically in respect to recruiting teachers in Wales to teach computer sciences in Secondary contexts. This was because of their perception that the nomenclature given to the PGCE courses such as 'Information Communications', 'Technology and Computing', 'Secondary Computing and ICT' were unlikely to attract computing science undergraduates. It was felt that there is lack of understanding that the subject of ICT is very different from Computer Science and that, therefore, a programme with that title can be off-putting.

> *"obviously, … when you look at like the physics, the maths and the computer science - computer sciences they do a heck of a lot of code, they build up so much knowledge based on code, like that's pretty much like second language to them and f they go to teach they'll never use that, like you just don't use… there's no reason t use code; you could try to but there no incentive for you to use code." Physics undergraduate*

4.21   The requirement in Wales for a 'B' grade at GCSE in both English and Maths was a highly contentious area. For many students there was frustration that if they were a Mathematics specialist and they were 'never' going to teach English then why should they need to resit their GCSE if they had a 'C'. This view was equally strongly held by students about Mathematics who felt they would 'never' need to or indeed want to teach it. It was also compounded because the requirement in England is currently a 'C' grade.

> *"it did put me off because I was so close to going to England where they don't need it." PGCE Primary student.*

4.22   Conversely, there was equal number of students who felt it was important for teachers to have a 'B' grade in both English and Mathematics as it 'set the standard' and exemplified the 'professional' standing of teaching as a profession. For some it was viewed as a benefit rather than a 'unnecessary hurdle' as they felt it demonstrated additional currency and credibility.

"it is a needed barrier." PGCE Primary student.

"having gone back it's refreshed my practice… it weeds out the people who are not willing to." PGCE Primary student.

4.23   Where there was complete consensus was in relation to this requirement needing to be much more explicit from the start of pupils' secondary education and revisited and reinforced at key points, especially when young people are making subject choices that might impact and inform career options. It was equally strongly noted that this should be a consideration and made clear in all English and Mathematics departments across Wales; as the current practice of often setting and streaming children from Year 7 could have severe and negative unintended consequences on career options and aspirations.

"my sister she would make the best teacher, she's incredible with people and incredible with children, she has displayed it ever since she was 13 and 12 and she was getting work experience in my dad's school… but she is awful at maths, awful, awful, awful at maths… she's had an awful experience with maths, she was put in the bottom set from year 8 onwards and then the confidence just went down and down and down and she's just given up on it, she's still trying to re-sit her GCSEs and she's 19. And since year 10/year 11 when she realised this is actually going to be really hard to get a B she doesn't want to be a teacher anymore". Social science undergraduate.

4.24   The need for far better quality and more positive marketing and promotion of teaching as a career is certainly highlighted by the views of the students who participated in the focus groups.

4.25   In contrast to the picture provided in 4.17 and 4.18 above, undergraduates from ITE shortage subject areas who had undertaken higher education work experience in schools held very strong views about their experiences.

4.26   They reported that these had strongly influenced their decision <u>not</u> to pursue a career in teaching. In STEM subjects this was often related to not being able to teach a less 'pure' version of a mathematical or physics concept and in others subjects due to the reality of seeing what teachers' day to day experiences were like.

"I had to follow a student around, so I went into a math class and then they're asking me questions and I'm like I can't tell you the answer, I can tell you the right answer but that's not the right answer for your exam… I was feeling very like quite down, if I'm being honest, … like I've gone through all of this, I'm paying, £53,000 for my degree and I can't answer these questions; I can answer the correct way but I can't answer it to a little kid, you know. So that, for me, was very hard for me to sort of teach something that I would have to re-undo everything I've learnt... I don't want to forget what I've learnt." Physics undergraduate.

"I've talked to teachers and they say oh, don't do it, don't do it, and that's you know my godmother saying don't do it and she's a teacher, she's a deputy head in a primary school but she's done it for 20 years and she's still in it. But I think work experience as well was the point where I said definitely not." Welsh undergraduate

4.27   The students also reflected that these negative perceptions were strengthened by the influence of their secondary school teachers and/or family members/significant others. These were seen to be highly influential in terms of career aspirations and perceptions of pursuing a career in teaching as opposed to more 'desirable' future roles in business management and analysis, banking, accountancy, insurance, finance, corporate trading, software development, actuary, the Security Service (MI5) and Government Communications Headquarters (GCHQ).

"my A-level teachers went a bit further and said those who can't – teach." Maths undergraduate.

"every single secondary teacher I've spoken to was like don't go into teaching." Welsh undergraduate.

"there was so much negativity around the idea of going into teaching… All sorts. Like from teachers I've spoken to, from people at like my school they'd be like, oh, you're grades are too good to be a teacher, you shouldn't be going into it and all stuff like that, and then they'd be like, oh, you should be doing this and then it's like it's not a good… like it's not a good career, you know it's stressful; everyone thinks it's easy, you have your holidays, but it's really stressful". Social Sciences undergraduate

"[My dad said] I thought you'd do something a bit better." PGCE Primary student.

"my parents are both teachers and they said 'no don't do it'. My dad, now a head of a special school, said 'no don't do it - go, do something else'." PGCE Primary student.

"you've got a first class degree in Physics - why on earth go into teaching - you could earn so much more" .PGCE Secondary student.

"my form teacher, my RE teacher and my Maths teacher said not to do teaching but my PE teacher said 'you're mad don't do - it'll kill you!'." PGCE Secondary student.

4.28   Many participants spoke about the stigma associated with teaching as being a real demotivating factor. This discourse dominated parts of almost all of the focus group sessions and coalesced around three main perspectives:

- The notion that 'those who can't – teach'.
- Persistent and extreme behaviour challenges in Secondary contexts.
- Excessive workload demands and expectations.

> *"my A-level teachers went a bit further and said those who can't - teach."* Maths undergraduate.

> *"my hesitancy towards teaching is from my family, watching the stress, but also from my experience as a student and seeing how teachers are treated by the students. They're just bullied in some instances and there's no respect as a profession."* MFL undergraduate

> *"my mum because she was in a secondary school, my dad's a lecturer, so my mum would like leave the house at, I don't know, 7.00 in the morning come back at 6.00, and then just complain about the day she'd had, like come back stressed and then like complain about everything and I was just like… she wasn't painting a good picture."* Welsh undergraduate.

4.29   Another demotivating factor was around the perceived stigma, status and value of some subjects. Whilst there was a view that this should change with the aspirations of the new curriculum it was viewed as unlikely that it would make any real difference:

> *"I think that people put Maths, English and Science as like the holy trinity of subjects that are most important … but I believe that languages are just as important."* MFL undergraduate

> *"languages and performing arts, they're subjects that … are seen as redundant by some people and that really puts me off because I don't want to have to keep battling to justify why I'm doing my job."* MFL undergraduate

Recruitment Incentives

4.30   What is available to assist the significant challenges that the above evidence suggests are faced in the promotion and marketing of teaching, are a range of financial incentives to encourage recruitment to ITE. These are a longstanding feature of ITE recruitment stretching back to the late 1990s. In Wales the current incentive offer is as below (Welsh Government, 2019a:14):

A	B	C
Training grant amount	Subject or Phase	Degree qualification classification
£20,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in mathematics, physics, chemistry, Welsh or computer science	1st and/or PhD/Masters
£15,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in Modern Foreign Languages	1st and/or PhD/Masters
£10,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in mathematics, physics, chemistry, Welsh or computer science	2.1
£6,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in modern foreign languages	2.1
£6,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in mathematics, physics, chemistry, Welsh or computer science	2.2
£3,000	Postgraduate secondary courses in design & technology, English, biology, history, religious education, art, physical education, music, drama, business studies, outdoor studies, general science or geography Postgraduate primary courses	1st and/or PhD/Masters
Additional £3,000 supplement	Postgraduate primary courses with a degree subject specialism of English, Welsh, Mathematics or core science	1st and/or PhD/Masters

4.31   The most recent research in Wales on the use of these incentives to attract students (undergraduate as well as postgraduate) to ITE through the medium of Welsh, found that they were not an important factor in recruiting students to PGCE courses, as most were unaware of these incentives before they applied. The research, therefore, recommended that the incentives be replaced through additional payments to those who took up teaching posts and in their early careers (Welsh Government, 2018b).

4.32   The limited impact of the incentives was also clear from the views expressed by some of the focus group participants, who did not see them as a good enough reason to pursue a career in teaching.

> "I feel like physics… like in those industries anyway there is such high pay that can it make a dent once they start working and you see other people who are going on to like engineering… it's so high paid it's hard to compete… because they're in private sectors and they've got the money to chuck… This [incentive] is not necessarily fixing the underlying problems. Giving us more money is not going to make us enjoy it [teaching] even more." Social science undergraduate

> *"I know with the PGCE in Wales for languages I think you get quite a large amount of money… 't's interesting that they put languages below those [STEM] subjects again… if I knew I wanted to go into teaching and I saw that I would think amazing! As someone who's not sure it's not something that would push me over the edge and say yes."* MFL undergraduate

4.33   An unforeseen consequence of these financial incentives which was raised by the Secondary PGCE students who were interviewed, was in respect of when they were training in a shortage STEM subject <u>and</u> through the medium of Welsh. If they were successful in securing a teaching job, they will in fact be less well-off financially than whilst they were training.

> *"what's going to be hard for me personally… obviously I've got the bursary as incentive and I'm most likely going to be earning less next year as an NQT."*

> *"that's the same for me."* 2 *PGCE Secondary students (shortage subjects and Welsh language).*

4.34   There is, therefore, the potential here that students undertake a PGCE to receive the bursary and then do not continue into the profession at all or for a period of time.

4.35   The research undertaken for this report has, therefore, not identified any evidence of the current ITE incentives having a major impact upon recruitment and the low recruitment figures in the targeted areas over recent years would appear to support this hypothesis.

4.36   A similar picture in England has led one researcher to propose that at least part of the existing budget for ITE incentives might be more effectively targeted on additional salary payments in the early years of a teachers' career (Sibieta, 2018).

Salaries and Conditions of Employment

4.37   The entry point for new teachers (outside of London) provides a salary of £23,720 and allows progression, without promotion or additional responsibilities, to £35,008. The starting salary is well below the median for leading graduate employers (£30,000), at the lower end of the careers which undergraduates in the focus groups indicated (3.17 above) but above what student constables receive and those involved in the prestigious Financial Services Graduate Scheme.

4.38   A recent report has pointed out that as a result of the recent recovery in private sector pay levels, the starting salary for teachers is now less attractive (particularly in secondary shortage areas because of the demand elsewhere for these graduates)

and is, therefore, inevitably one of the reasons for recruitment and retention problems. This leads the author of the report to recommend that salary levels should be increased in the early years of a teacher's career, particularly in shortage areas and for those teaching in disadvantaged communities (Sibieta, 2018).

4.39   The PGCE students who were interviewed for the focus groups generally felt the starting salary was acceptable but didn't view this in isolation as job security and length of contact were seen as equally important.

> "the starting salary [in teaching] is great - great if hand in hand with job security." PGCE Secondary student.

4.40   Many of the Secondary PGCE students also voiced a concern about being able to secure a job in Wales having achieved their PGCE. This was surprising given that there is perceived to be a problem in recruiting to shortage subjects in Wales.

4.41   It was also the perception of the participants that they would be expected as NQTs to teach subjects which were outside their expertise and that they would need to 'teach themselves'. Consequently, a number had applied and successfully secured jobs in England.

> "I'm the only one with a job on my course… and I'll be teaching English [not her discipline] too." PGCE Secondary student.

> "my sister is a French and Spanish teacher… she's been forced to teach Year 7 and 8 and Welsh Baccalaureate, Welsh and English… she enjoys the French and Spanish teaching… [the rest] it's just extra work because it's not even her subject and she feels she's out of her depth." Welsh undergraduate student.

> "I'm only one of three in my course who has a job… my job is in England… I had one job interview for a Welsh school and it was a temporary 1 year placement and all the jobs that were few and far between… they were only ever for one year. The job in England is permanent fulltime." PGCE Secondary (shortage subject) student.

4.42   Given the ongoing difficulties which are being faced in ITE recruitment and the extent to which these are exacerbated by problems with retention in the profession, it might be argued that focusing as much, if not more, on teacher retention through the early career years might be a more effective strategy than incentivising recruitment (Worth et al, 2018; Kula- Acevedo, 2009; Kraft and Papay, 2014; Allen et al, 2016).

4.43   The pressures on early career teachers were highlighted in a recent review commissioned by Welsh Government on teachers' pay and conditions of employment which pointed to the growing complexity of teaching as a profession, the image of a 'relentless, high pressure and highly scrutinised pattern of work' that is 'debilitating for many teachers and is turning their focus away from the joyous aspects of their work'

(Welsh Government, 2018a:22). It concluded that recent attempts by Welsh Government and its partners to reduce workload were well-intentioned but 'have fallen on stony ground' (Welsh Government, 2018a:23).

4.44   These conclusions are supported by wider research literature which suggest that teaching is perceived as rewarding by most teachers but that many teachers also report a high degree of stress and symptoms of burnout (Johnson & Birkeland, 2003; Neves de Jesus & Lens, 2005; Stoeber & Rennert, 2008). The most significant factors which appear to decide whether or not a teacher leaves or remains in the profession are job satisfaction and stress/ burnout. Supportive school environments and positive social relations with parents, colleagues, and the school leadership are also predictive of teachers' job satisfaction and motivation to stay in the profession whereas time pressure and discipline problems are predictive of lower levels of job satisfaction (Day, Sammons, Stobard et al., 2007; Johnson & Birkeland, 2003; Scheopner, 2010; Weiss, 1999).

4.45   These perspectives were also reflected in the focus group discussions with undergraduate students There was an underlying narrative in many focus groups that placed a significant value on the quality of a work / life balance. This balance was viewed as an incentive for many roles and central to this was the idea of 'not bringing work home'. This was perceived to be impossible in the context of teaching.

> *"just general stress… dad again, the amount of times… I've seen him come home and he's stressing and he just goes straight to bed or goes straight to his office and then you barely see him because he's just focusing on the work. And to get the higher pay you need to go higher up in the SLT but then that gets more stress, less on the students but overall of the school as a whole. And if results are bad from the teachers then they get all the blame". Maths undergraduate.*

> *"the time it takes. There's not enough hours in the day to do... you've got to do all the paperwork for that day ... got marking and your planning for the next day and just when you add it up you just think where is your free time in all of this? My mum's nearly 60 and she's doing 70 hour weeks and that's not… that's not healthy, that's not healthy for someone in their 20s." MFL undergraduate*

4.46   Research comparing the working conditions of teachers compared to nurses and police officers found that 'teachers work considerably longer hours during term time' and have the lowest satisfaction with their leisure time, concluding that 'working long hours over prolonged periods…can create pressure and stress, with potential negative effects on health and well-being' and was one of the main reasons why teachers were leaving the profession (Worth et al, 2018:3).

4.47   Noting that 40% of teachers who complete ITE are no longer working in state schools 5 years later, another study concluded:

''The brutal asymmetry between the pressures we place on our teachers and the support we give them has led to an epidemic of burnout in the classroom and an exodus from the profession, far in excess of what we see in other European countries'' (Allen and Sims, 2018:5).

4.48   The NFER research identified that teachers who left the profession to take other jobs on average earned 10% less than they had in teaching, but reported that the benefits of job satisfaction, reduced workload and more flexible working hours outweighed the financial loss (Worth et al, 2018).

4.49   The possibility of part-time working and more flexible working hours was identified as a major factor in these decisions to change career, particularly for female teachers with families (Worth et al, 2018). This is reinforced by the Welsh Government pay and conditions review which found that 'whilst schools try to be family friendly, they are constrained by working routines and practices that inhibit the development of new and more welcoming approaches' (Welsh Government, 2018:26).

4.50   As some of the focus group participants identified, however, the established routines and 'security for life' aspects of teaching were quite attractive to some.

> *"you said about job security, I think it's definitely been a factor for me that I've always been told that there's like… every school needs maths teachers… so anywhere I go in the whole country I could… I could get a job there." Maths undergraduate*

> *"stability… as a bloke going to a PGCE… I'm not actually sure how true this it but the impression I've had from other people is that I'm sort of guaranteed some form of job after I've finished, especially in the primary school world." Social science undergraduate.*

4.51   The evidence presented above, therefore, supports other research which suggests that whilst increasing teacher's pay may impact on recruitment and retention issues, particularly in shortage areas and for early career teachers, this may need to be accompanied by improvements in working conditions to reduce workload, improve job satisfaction, introducing more flexible working arrangements (Worth et al, 2018; Bergmark et al, 2018;Johnson, Berg, & Donaldson, 2005; Kyriacou, Kunc, Stephens, & Hultgren, 2003;Borman & Dowling, 2008).

4.52   In the view of one recent study on teacher recruitment and retention what stands in the way of resolving the challenges currently faced in these areas is not ' a lack of financial incentives, but a working environment that all too often inhibits their natural motivation to learn and develop as professionals' (Allen and Sims, 2018:69).

Career Progression and Development

4.52 As has been seen to be the case in other professions the extent of support and professional development (or 'professional learning' as it is now called within the Welsh education system) available to teachers, particularly at the outset of their careers, undoubtedly has a critically important part to play in a wider strategy focused on recruitment to and retention within the profession.

4.53 The undergraduate students who participated in the focus groups did not perceive this to be an attractive aspect of a career in teaching:

> *"No, the main [issue with teaching]... is because there's no growth, there's no progression in the line, I think that for me is probably what it was. Because obviously I've always wanted… as soon as I've got one challenge done I want to aim for something, I just want to accomplish something and if it's not a promotion or somewhere I can aim for it's like… you need to be mentally stimulated and challenged..."Physics undergraduate*

> *"guaranteed stability... and support… especially with like help with like mentoring and stuff… because that's a big pressure... you're kind of like a second parent in the school, it's just like a lot psychologically on top of the workload, on top of teaching… I don't want to ever feel like I don't know if I'm doing my job right." Welsh undergraduate*

> *"I've only met one teacher who knew what he was actually teaching… I got the impression that he felt like he was alone on an island because he just was going insane that he had no one to like bounce ideas off." Computer Science undergraduate*

4.54   The beginning of a teacher's professional learning journey is through ITE and the reforms currently being made by the Welsh Government (Furlong, 2015) provide an opportunity to strengthen this. Some commentators have suggested that retention problems in the early years of teaching results from the failure of ITE to provide student teachers with the opportunity 'to practice evidence-based techniques in realistic environments with the help of an expert coach giving them efficient feedback' (Allen and Sims, 2018: 105).

4.55   This leads them to argue for a longer ITE period for teachers, beginning with a 2-year ITE course, followed by 4 years of teaching before QTS is confirmed, with a one-third timetable being taught in Year 1 and two-thirds in Year 2. This, they argue, would bring the initial development of teachers into line with the way, for example, that doctors are trained and with most European countries where the minimum duration of teacher education is 4-6 years (Allen and Sims, 2018).

4.56   In Wales following ITE, newly-qualified teachers (NQTs) are required to complete an induction period of three school terms or the equivalent during which they should receive support from a school-based mentor and their Regional Education Consortia (Welsh Government, 2017). They are expected to teach no more than a 90% timetable and to complete an induction profile evidencing how they are meeting

the Welsh Government Professional Standards for Teaching and Leadership (Welsh Government, 2017c).

4.57   The importance of mentoring within early career development in teaching as in other professions is widely recognised (Hobson et al, 2016; Langdon et al, 2019). Whilst there is a lack of evidence on the quality of the mentoring (or coaching) that is currently offered to NQTs in Wales, a recent Estyn report on mentoring in ITE (Estyn, 2018) pointed to variable quality taking place in the schools visited. Given that ITE and NQT mentoring are often undertaken by the same members of staff, this is clearly a cause for concern.

4.58   A range of professional learning opportunities for NQTs is available in each Consortium. In one, for example, after an initial induction session, NQTs have a twilight, four full-days and, at the end of the year, a half-day to reflect on their induction experiences at one of the Consortium's Professional Learning Schools. The focus of each of the days is:

- Influencing Learning: aspects of effective learning pedagogy developed by the school.
- Refining Teaching: effective teaching pedagogy.
- Advanced Learning: including authentic learning and cross-curricular themes.
- Leadership: successful leadership practice within the school.

4.59   The Welsh Government is currently working with the Consortia to review this provision for NQTs as part of its response to the review of the profession it commissioned in 2018, which proposed that support for early career teachers should be extended to the fourth year of their career, with the possibility of building upon some existing practice where NQTs are deployed across a group of schools to provide a wider range of early career experience and development (Welsh Government, 2018a).

4.60   Following induction and confirmation of qualified teacher status (QTS), there is no requirement upon teachers in Wales to progress through any further professional learning or to acquire additional qualifications. This flies in the face of what we know from nearly all other professions about the importance of ongoing career development: in the medical and clinical professions, for example, professional learning is gradual and not front-loaded as it is in teaching (Allen and Sims, 2018). Research on why teachers stay in the profession, rather than leave, also comes to the same conclusions (Chiong et al, 2017)

4.61   In a recent annual report the Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales pointed out that in four-in -ten schools' Leaders have not established a culture of professional learning where staff have open and honest discussions about their own practice' (Estyn, 2018; 22) and a recent review of the profession for Welsh Government noted the importance of leadership in schools that had been visited where 'the excitement and enthusiasm for the detail of teachers' work and achievements of

young people dominated' and teachers were' engaged in professional learning, innovating, working together and intently focused on pedagogy' (Welsh Government, 2018a: 24).

4.62   The review also noted that early career development for teachers in Wales did not allow for the flexible and varied progression and experience routes that were available in many other professions and which the so called 'millennial generation' are strongly motivated by (Welsh Government, 2018a citing Bresman, 2015; Worth et al, 2018).

4.63   The undergraduate students involved in the focus groups also did not perceive this to be an attractive feature of teaching. There was a perception amongst some participants that progression opportunities were limited in schools.

4.64   Whilst some of this perception may be based on a lack of knowledge of the profession it might, however, be associated with a perception that even where career progression is possible, it is harder to achieve because you have to 'serve you time' and/or 'earn your stripes' before being considered 'credible'.

> ''I think the main crux of it is the fact that if you go into business there's always a route you can go, you can always… it always looks like you're… you know, you can be your boss's boss or your boss's boss's boss... There's progression, right, but within a school you don't really get that. I mean, if you go into a maths department you're a teacher, you… and then obviously once you're the head of the department there's only one jump you can really make, unless you want to be, you know, the school's dean. " Physics undergraduates.

5. MAIN FINDINGS

5.1   Employers who successfully recruit graduates, generally offer a range of incentives including:

- Positive and high-quality career marketing and promotion including, in some cases, paid work-experience.
- An attractive starting salary and good security of employment.
- Conditions of employment that support the work/life balance and wellbeing of employees.
- Sustained early career induction and support.
- Ongoing opportunities, which in some cases are mandatory and linked to 'fitness to practice', for professional development.
- Career experiences and progression that reflect the perceived desire of 'millennials' for what are known as 'portfolio careers'.
- Flexible working arrangements.

5.2   Financial incentives used for recruitment and retention purposes, appear to play at most a minimal part within these holistic strategies and when they are used, are generally targeted at first-post employment and retention in-post.

5.3   By comparison recruitment to and retention in teaching in Wales (unlike some other public sector professions which are currently developing workforce strategies) is not supported by such a holistic strategy:

- Positive and high-quality marketing and promotion of the profession is almost totally absent: given the negative perceptions of the teaching profession held by many of the undergraduates interviewed for this report, this is a significant weakness.

- Much of this negative perception arises from the heavy workloads and poor wellbeing associated with teaching.

- Starting salaries are generally thought to be at a reasonable level and are not the main factors associated with recruitment and retention challenges, but the prevalence of 1-year contracts and the consequent lack of job security is a disincentive to recruitment.

- Early career induction and support is only statutorily in place for the first year of a teacher's career and thereby, its range and depth appears to be limited compared to similar professions.

- There is not a requirement for teachers to engage in professional learning following their induction year, including any stipulation associated with renewal of 'fitness to practice'.

- Limited opportunities exist for developing 'portfolio careers'.

- Very limited opportunities exist for flexible working arrangements.

5.4   It can be suggested that the financial incentives available to assist recruitment to ITE courses do not compensate for the lack of a more holistic approach to recruitment and retention in Wales and on face-value appear to have only had limited impact. The lack of awareness of these incentives and the marginal impact they might have in overcoming negative perceptions of teaching have been identified in this report. Whilst we recognise that there is a lack of counter-factual evidence to indicate what might happen to ITE recruitment if they were removed, our hypothesis is that this would have a minimal effect.

5.5   Given the findings above, we believe that if learning is to be derived from the experience in other professions, including those in both the private and public sectors who are facing many of the same recruitment and retention issues as in teaching, it is the lack of a holistic workforce strategy for teacher recruitment and retention in Wales which is the major deficit.

5.6   Based on what we know from educational research on the importance of teacher quality as a determinant of high pupil achievement, we suggest, therefore, that our findings and recommendations should have urgent consideration if the current educational objectives of the Welsh Government are to be achieved.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

Welsh Government, as part of its national strategy for education (Welsh Government, 2017) and in its response to the report on the careers, conditions and pay framework for school- teachers in Wales (2018) should:

6.1   Develop a holistic workforce strategy for the teaching profession in Wales, based on robust recruitment and retention evidence, in which any future use of financial incentives might be a component part.

6.2   Consider, if financial incentives were to be part of this strategy, their use across the recruitment/employment in first-post in Wales/ early career continuum.

6.3   As part of the strategy develop a high-quality promotion and marketing campaign which counteracts existing negative perceptions of teaching and includes:

- The involvement of the teaching associations, parents and other key stakeholders to create a sense of national pride in the teaching profession.
- Uses successful teachers and school leaders in recruitment and retention activities.
- Regional partnerships between university subject departments, careers services, ITE departments and ITE lead partnership schools to promote ITE recruitment, particularly to shortage subject areas.
- Work experience programmes in ITE lead partnership schools for undergraduates in shortage areas which allow them to gain some form of recognition (financial payment/academic credit/a combination of these).
- Clear messages about ITE entry requirements that are targeted at pupils/students at important points in their secondary and higher education.

6.4   Introduce a 3-year *Induction and Early-Career Teacher Development Programme*.

6.5   As part of the development of the *National Approach to Professional Learning* and building upon clinical-practice approaches within the new ITE programmes, introduce a career-long requirement for teachers to participate in professional learning, including attaining higher-level qualifications.

6.6   Ensure that within the terms and conditions of employment for teachers in Wales, issues associated with workload, wellbeing, flexible working and career portfolios are addressed in a way that reflects practice in other professions.

6.7   Commission further research on how the strategy can reflect the most effective practice currently present in teaching and other professions.

7. REFERENCES

Adult Nurse Job Profile (2019). Prospects: available on-line at
https://www.prospects.ac.uk/job-profiles/adult-nurse

Allen, R., Mian, E., and Sims, S. (2016). *Are there social inequalities in access to high quality teachers?* London: Social Market Foundation.

Allen, R. and Sims, S. (2018). *The Teacher Gap.* Abingdon: Routledge.

Barber, M. and Mourshed, M. (2007). *How the world's best-performing school systems come out on top.* London: McKinsey and Company.

Bergmark, U., Lundstrom, S., Manderstedt, L. and Palo, A. (2018). 'Why become a teacher? Student teachers' perceptions of the teaching profession and motives for career choice'. *European Journal of Teacher Education*: published on-line at
https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2018.1448784

Besley, T. and Ghatak, M. (2005). 'Competition and incentives with motivated agents'. *American Economic Review*. 95(3): 616-636.

Borman, G and Dowling, J. (2008) *Teacher Attrition and Retention: A Meta-Analytic and Narrative Review of the Research* https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654308321455

Bresman, H. (2015). What millennials want from work, charted across the world. *Harvard Business Review*, volume 2.

Care Council for Wales and Care and Social Service Inspectorate Wales (n.d). *The first three years in practice: A framework for social workers' induction into qualified practice and continuing professional education and learning.* Cardiff: Social Care Wales and CCSIW.

Chapman, C., Armstrong, P., Harris, A., Muijs, D., Reynolds, D. and Sammons, P. (2012) *School Effectiveness and Improvement Research, Policy and Practice*. London: Routledge

Chickering, A.W., and L. Reisser. 1993*. Education and identity*. 2nd ed. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Clark, M., Zukas, M., & Lent, N. (2011). 'Becoming an IT person: Field, habitus and capital in the transition from university to work'. *Vocations and Learning*, 4(2):133–150.

Chiong, C., Menzies, L. and Parameshwaran (2017). 'Why do long-serving teachers stay in the teaching profession? Analysing the motivations of teachers with 10 or more years' experience in England'. *British Educational Research Journal* 43(6):1083-1110.

Council of Deans of Health (2018). *Nursing, midwifery and allied health clinical academic research careers in the UK.*

Crebert, G., Bates, M., Bell, S., Patrick, C. and Vonda, C. (2007). 'Developing generic skills at university, during work placements and in employment: graduates' perceptions'. *Higher Education Research and Development*. 23(2):147-165.

Curtis, L., Moriarty, J. and Netton, A. (2010). 'The expected life of a Social Worker'. *British Journal of Social Work.* 40 (5): 1628-1643

Day, C., Sammons, P., Stobard, G., Kington, A. and Gu, Q. (2007). *Teachers matter: Connecting work, lives and effectiveness.* Berkshire: Open University Press.

Department of Business, Innovation and Skills (2015*). Graduate Recruitment and Selection Evidence Report.* London: Department of Business, Innovation and Skills.

Donaldson, G, (2015). *Successful Futures Independent Review of Curriculum and Assessment Arrangements in Wales* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Estyn (2007). *The impact of the induction and early professional development programme on teachers' job satisfaction and retention*. Cardiff: Estyn

Estyn (2017). *The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales 2015-2016.* Cardiff: Estyn.

Estyn (2018). *The professional learning continuum: mentoring in initial teacher education.* Cardiff: Estyn

Evans, M., Phillips, C. J., Roberts, R.N. and Salter, D. (2015). *Health Professional Educational Investment Review.*

Faron, S. and Poeltler, D., 2007. Growing our own: inspiring growth and increasing retention through mentoring. *Nursing for women's health*, *11*(2):139-143.

Fielding, R. (2019) 4 Predictions for Graduate Recruitment in 2019. Available at https://luminate.prospects.ac.uk/four-predicyions-for-graduate-recruitment-in-2019

Furlong, J. (2015). *Teaching Tomorrow's Teachers Options for the future of initial teacher education in Wales* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

General Teaching Council for Wales (2002). *Recruitment and Retention Survey.* Cardiff: GTCW

General Teaching Council for Wales (2003). *Action Plan for Teacher Recruitment and Retention.* Cardiff: GTCW

Greaves, L. (2018) Top 10 jobs viewed on Prospects.ac.uk. Available at https://luminate.prospects.ac.uk/top-10-jobs-viewed-on-prospects-ac-uk

Greaves, L. (2019). Key trends among UK first-degree graduates. Prospects; available on-line at https://luminate.prospects.Ac.uk/key-trends-among-uk-first-degree-graduates

HECSU (n.d.). *What do graduates do? 2018/19.*Available at www.hecsu.ac.uk

HESA (2017). Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education in the United Kingdom for the academic year 2015/16. Available at https://www.hesa.ac.uk/news/29-06-2017/sfr245-destinationas-of-leavers#

HESA (2018). Higher Education Leavers Statistics 2016/17. Available at https://www.hesa.ac.uk/news/28-06-2018/sfr250-higher-education-leaver-statistics-activities

High- Fliers Research (2019). *The Graduate Market in 2019*. London: High- Fliers Research.

Hobson, C. (2018). 'Which graduates start their careers in teaching and education'? Prospects: available on-line at https://luminate.prospects.ac.uk/which-graduates-start-their-careers-in-teaching-and-education

Ingersoll. R.M. (2001). 'Teacher turnover and teacher shortages; an organizational analysis'. *American Educational Research Journal*. 38(3): 499-534.

Johnson, S.M and Birkeland, S.E. (2003). 'Pursuing a ''sense of success''. New teachers explain their career decisions. *American Educational Research Journal* (40): 581-617.

Johnson, S.M., Berg, J.H., Donaldson, M. L. (2005*) Who stays in teaching and why: A review of the literature on teacher retention. NRT*A's Educator Support Network.

Kyriacou, S., Kunc, R., Stephens, P., & Hultgren, A. (2003). Student Teachers' Expectations of Teaching as a Career in England and Norway. *Educational Review*, 55: 255-263.

Kools, M. and Stoll, L. (2016). *What Makes A School A Learning Organisation?* Paris: OECD.

Kraft, M.A. and Papay, J.P. (2014). 'Can professional environments in schools promote teacher development? Explaining heterogeneity in returns to teaching experience'. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 36(4):476-500.

Kukla-Acevedo, S. (2009). 'Leavers, movers and stayers: The role of workplace conditions in teacher mobility decisions. *The Journal of Educational Research*., 102(6), 443-452.

Langdon, F., Daly, C., Milton, E., Jones, K. and Palmer, M. (2019).' Challenges for principled induction and mentoring of new teachers- lessons from New Zealand and Wales'. *London Review of Education*; 17(2); in press.

Latham, C.L., Hogan, M. and Ringl, K., 2008. Nurses supporting nurses: Creating a mentoring program for staff nurses to improve the workforce environment. *Nursing Administration Quarterly*, *32*(1):.27-39.

Lindqvist, P. and Nordanger, U. (2015) Already elsewhere – A study of (skilled) teacher's choice to leave teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education,* 54(1): 88-97

Luekens, M.T., Lyter, D.M. and Fox, E.E. (2004). *Teacher attrition and mobility: Results from the teacher follow-up survey, 2000-2001*. Washington: National Centre for Education Statistics.

Moriarty, J., Manthorpe, J. and Harris, J. (2018). *Recruitment and retention in adult social care services.* Social Care Workforce Research Unit.

National Health Service Wales (n.d.). Nursing Careers in Wales. Available on-line at www.TrainWorkLive.wales

Neves de Jesus, S. And Lens, W. (2005). 'An integrated model for the study of teacher motivation'. *Applied Psychology*. (54): 119-134

Nursing and Midwifery Council (2019). *Revalidation: How to revalidate with the NMC.*

OECD (2005). *Teachers matter: Attracting, developing and retaining effective teachers.* Paris: OECD.

Scheopner, A. J. (2010). 'Irreconciable differences: Teacher attrition in public and catholic schools.' Educational Research Review (5): 261-277.

Sibieta, L. (2018). *The teacher labour market in England: Shortages, subject expertise and incentives*. London: Education Policy Institute.

Social Care Wales (n.d). *Consolidation Programme for Newly Qualified Social Workers.* Cardiff: Social Care Wales.

Social Care Wales (n.d.). *Continuing Professional Education and Learning for social workers.* Cardiff: Social Care Wales

Social Care Wales (2018*) Impact report 2017-18: Making a positive difference to social care in Wales. Cardiff*: Social Care Wales.

Statistics Sweden (2012). *Trends and forecasts.*

Stoeber, J. and Rennert, D. (2008). 'Perfectionism in school teachers: Relations with stress appraisals, coping styles and burnout'. *Anxiety, Stress and Coping: An International Journal. (*21):37-53

Swedish National Agency for Higher Education (2012). *Higher Education and the labor market.*

The Guardian (6 September, 2016). How can social work find a sustainable solution to its recruitment crisis? Available at https://www.theguardian.com/social-care-network/2016/sep/06/social-work-sustainable-solution-recruitment-crisis

The Guardian (8 April, 2019). 'Councils spend millions on social work agencies'

The Interprofessional CPD and Lifelong Learning UK Working Group (2019). *Principles for continuing professional development and lifelong learning in health and social care.*

Unesco Institute for Statistics (2009). *Projecting the global demand for teachers: Meeting the goal of universal primary education by 2015.*

Weiss, E.M. (1999). 'Perceived workplace conditions and first year teachers' morale, career choice commitment and planned retention: A secondary analysis'. *Teaching and Teacher Education* (27): 1029-1038

Welsh Government (2015). *Research into nurse staffing levels.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2017a). *Induction for newly qualified teachers in Wales*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2017b). *Education In Wales: Our National Mission.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2017c) *Professional Standards for Teaching and Leadership.*

Welsh Government (2018a). *Teaching: A valued profession working towards a Career, Conditions and Pay Framework for School Teachers in Wales: The report of the independent review.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2018b). *Evaluation of Welsh-Medium Provision in Initial Teacher Education.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2018c). *A Healthier Wales: our Plan for Health and Social Care.* Cardiff: Welsh Government

Welsh Government (2019a). *Teacher training incentives in Wales -academic year 2019/20.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government (2019b). *Staff directly employed by the NHS in Wales at 30 September 2018.* Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Worth, J., Lynch, S., Hillary, J., Rennie, C. and Andrade, J. (2018). *Teacher Workforce Dynamics in England.* Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research.