



Migration Advisory Committee Call for Evidence June 2016

Partial Review of the Shortage Occupation List: Teachers

Supporting Evidence from the Education Workforce Council

Introduction

The Education Workforce Council (EWC) was established by the Education (Wales) Act 2014. It is the independent regulator in Wales for teachers in maintained schools, Further Education teachers and learning support staff in both school and Further Education settings. There is also an intention by Welsh Government for the Education Workforce Council to regulate Youth Workers and people involved in Work Based Learning from April 2017.

The principal aims of Council are to:

- contribute to improving the standards of teaching and the quality of learning in Wales;
- maintain and improve standards of professional conduct amongst teachers and persons who support teaching and learning in Wales;
- safeguard the interests of learners, parents and the public and maintain public trust and confidence in the education workforce.

This document is supplied by the Education Workforce Council in support of the Migration Advisory Committee call for evidence relating to the shortage occupation list in respect of teachers and aims to supply evidence which has a Welsh dimension. This will review current national data trends and will look at data from the register of education practitioners which is held by the EWC for teachers in Wales. Whilst the Council is not in a position to answer all questions posed in the consultation, it holds unique data pertinent to the Welsh education workforce. The information contained within is not intended to be exhaustive, but identifies some key considerations relating to the Wales and the education workforce in Wales to support ongoing policy development.

The Education Workforce Council regularly supplies Welsh Government with valuable data from its register of teachers to support workforce planning in order that it can be responsive to changes in the teaching environment and take appropriate action as required. At 10 June 2016, there were 68,873 practitioners registered with the Council. 34,542 school teachers, 5,314 Further Education teachers, 26,883 school learning support workers, and 2,134 Further Education learning support workers.

The EWC publishes an Annual Statistical Digest based on the data it holds which is available on our website (www.ewc.wales). This data can be drilled down further if this would prove useful. Data from the most recent digest highlights that as at March 2016, there were 36,951 teachers registered with the Education Workforce Council. A total of 75.4% of those registered were female. 33% of teachers were Welsh speakers and 27.4% indicated that they were able to teach through the medium of Welsh.

Whilst part of the UK, it is important to recognise that Wales differs in some key respects from the rest of the UK in terms of demographics, education policy and education workforce issues. It is important to recognise that geographical areas of the UK experience very different issues relating to the education workforce and in relation to education in general.

Demographics

The demographic make-up of Wales differs in some respects to that of England, and as such, policy developed by Welsh Government will seek to address issues relevant to Wales. In terms of population alone, there are vast differences discernible from available data, the most obvious being the overall population size of England in relation to Wales.

- The population of Wales represents only a small proportion of the overall population of the UK. On 30 June 2015 there were estimated to be 3,099,086 people living in Wales. The population of England currently stands at 54,786,300 and accounts for 84% of the UK's population
- The population of Wales has remained relatively stable - A similar number of births and deaths resulted in no natural change to the population of Wales. In the UK overall, however, ONS data¹ indicates that London had the largest natural change of all regions with 78,400 more births than deaths, and the North East of England the smallest, with 100 more deaths than births.
- Whilst English is the main spoken language in Wales, it is important to acknowledge that there is a significant Welsh language speaking community and an active policy in Wales to increase the number of Welsh speakers. According to the Welsh Language Use Survey 2013-15², 24% of people aged three and over were able to speak Welsh. The percentage of Welsh speakers decreased with age; it was at its highest amongst the 3 to 15 age group, 41%, and at its lowest amongst the 45 to 64 age group, 18%.

School Population

There are key differences in the school populations of England and Wales which again highlights how the Welsh policy has to respond specifically to the challenges in the education workforce on a more localised level. Financial challenges have meant many rural schools in Wales have had to merge or close as low pupil numbers have rendered some schools unsustainable. There is anecdotal evidence that Welsh medium schools are an attractive prospect for residents of cities and towns in England who are in close proximity to Wales, putting pressure on Welsh schools. It is also important to recognise that Wales does not have free schools or academies.

The current position in Wales:

- According to the School Census published 27 July 2016³ there were 13 nursery, 1,310 primary, 7 middle schools, 205 secondary schools and 39 special schools in Wales. Of these, 428 primary, 5 middle, and 49 secondary schools were classified as Welsh Medium. There was no change in the number of independent schools (66). Overall there were 21 fewer Local Authority (LA) maintained schools than at January 2015.
- The total number of pupils in LA maintained schools was 466,555, a rise of 851 pupils since January 2015.

¹ Population Estimates for UK, England and Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland: mid-2015, Published 23 June 2016, ONS. Available from: <https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/populationandmigration/populationestimates/bulletins/annualmidyearpopulationestimates/latest>

² Welsh language use in Wales, 2013-15. Published 26 November 2015, Welsh Government. Available from: <http://gov.wales/docs/statistics/2016/160301-welsh-language-use-in-wales-2013-15-en.pdf>

³ School Census Results, 2016. Published 27 July 2016, Statistics for Wales, Welsh Government. Available from: <http://gov.wales/statistics-and-research/schools-census/?lang=en>

- The number of pupils aged 5 to 10 has increased to 207,328 in 2016 compared to 203,847 in 2015. The number of pupils aged under 5 has been increasing since 2006.
- Gwynedd had the most Welsh medium school (105) and Blaenau Gwent had the fewest (1)
- The percentage of pupils whose ethnic background was classified as minority ethnic origin was 10.1 and 0.5 per cent were unknown or not stated.

The situation is very different in England:

- There are a total of 8.56⁴ million pupils in schools in England (All schools)
- The number of pupils in state funded primary schools rose – as it has done over the last seven years and currently stands at 4,615,170 and state funded secondary schools number 3,193,420.
- In primary schools, 31.4% of pupils are of minority ethnic origin and 27.9% in secondary schools.

Trends in Relation to Overseas Applicants for QTS

The Migration Observatory suggests that there is significant variation in the geographic distribution of migrants in the UK⁵. In 2014, approximately half of the UK's foreign born population were in London (36.9%) and the South East (13.6%). Wales has the third lowest share of the UK's total foreign born population (2.3%) by Government Office Region.

Teachers who are recognised as qualified school teachers in Scotland, Northern Ireland, or any member state of the European Economic Area (EEA) can apply for direct recognition of their status in Wales. Part of the EWC remit is to determine applications for Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) from teachers from other parts of the UK and the EEA. Wales differs from England with respect to school teachers who trained in Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the USA and who have been awarded QTS by the National College for Teaching & Leadership (NCTL) in England. This recognition is NOT recognised under Welsh regulations. Welsh Government has not created direct routes for this cohort, since there are not the same issues relating to teacher vacancies experienced in England.

Annex A illustrates the number of applications from other UK countries and the EEA by year and shows this in the context of overall registered teacher numbers. There are some interesting trends in relation to the data.

- The number of applications for QTS awarded for EEA applicants and those from Northern Ireland and Scotland constitute a very small proportion of all registered teachers. Applications are low this might be explained by the scarcity of vacancies and the demand for Welsh speakers. The Welsh Government is currently consulting on the draft strategy⁶ to create a million Welsh speakers by 2050 and this may have further implications for teachers wishing to practise in Wales.
- EEA applicants applying to register with the EWC have recently been from countries such as Spain and Poland, however a number of applications have been received from Greece which is likely to be attributable to the economic and employment problems experienced in the country over recent years.

⁴ Schools Pupils and their characteristics, Department for Education published 28 June 2016 [available from <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/schools-pupils-and-their-characteristics-january-2016>]

⁵ Briefing: Migrants in the UK: An Overview. Published 28 January 2015, The Migration Observatory at the University of Oxford. Available from: http://www.migrationobservatory.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Briefing-Migrants_in_the_UK_Overview.pdf

⁶ <https://consultations.gov.wales/consultations/welsh-language-strategy>

- Now that the Education Workforce Council is also responsible for registration of learning support assistants, new patterns are emerging in that a large number of those from countries outside Wales are actually employed as learning support assistants which further demonstrates how different the education arena is in Wales. This also suggests a saturated workforce in other sectors.
- The Education Workforce Council does not publish data on the country of origin pertaining to registered teachers. Data is published, however, in relation to ethnicity and national identity of registered teachers which may be of interest. This data should not be used as a proxy for country of origin. Annex B highlights the current data held by the Education Workforce Council in relation to these areas.

Use of Supply Teachers in Wales

It is acknowledged that in Wales there are issues in relation to the supply workforce, with a particular concern around the extensive use of supply teachers to cover in schools. In 2014, the General Teaching Council for Wales (the body that was reconfigured to create the Education Workforce Council in April 2015) undertook a survey of supply teachers on behalf of the Welsh Government in order to collect valuable data in relation to this sector in Wales. This assisted in developing a more comprehensive understanding of the issues which impact upon them and to assist in workforce planning. The data from the survey was utilised to support the 2015 Welsh Government Inquiry⁷ into the use of supply teachers across Wales.

The survey conducted in Wales attracted a favourable response rate of 2,162 (41.4%) persons, with the respondent profile closely reflecting the total number of registered supply teachers in Wales. A copy of the full analysis can be provided upon request. Supply teachers in Wales were predominantly either

- (a) in the early part of their careers and undertook supply work largely due to a lack of permanent or temporary long term contracts or
- (b) towards the end of their teaching career or retired from a substantive teaching post. These two groups accounted for approximately 66% of the supply teachers who responded to the survey.

- The most common reasons for schools to require supply teachers are to cover for sickness absence in Wales (41.1%) and for permanent teachers to undertake professional development (32.9%).
- As part of the survey, qualitative research was also undertaken with Local Authorities and Agencies. The feedback was analogous with the findings from the quantitative study. One agency proffered that the reason some individuals took on supply work was that there was a lack of permanent roles (in particular sectors) and that for some it was a mechanism for introducing themselves into teaching (i.e. by showcasing abilities to a variety of schools).

⁷ National Assembly for Wales Children, Young People and Education Committee Inquiry into Supply Teaching December 2015 [available from <http://www.assembly.wales/laid%20documents/cr-ld10483/cr-ld10483-e.pdf>]

- Supply teachers mainly worked in the primary phase (59.4%). This is consistent with other data the Council holds, which shows that it is more difficult to secure substantive teaching posts in the primary phase due to an over-supply of teachers in Wales in this phase.
- Supply teachers who responded to the survey worked almost exclusively through supply agencies or through a direct arrangement with a particular school or schools. Very few supply teachers worked through a Local Authority supply pool and these are now very much in decline. Furthermore, those in the early stages of their teaching career worked mainly through private supply agencies, whereas experienced supply teachers towards the end of their careers obtained their work from schools who contacted them directly.
- The average number of days each supply teacher respondent worked was 2.7. However, it was evident that those in the early part of their teaching career sought to work for as many days as possible (average 3.5 days per week). Conversely, those who qualified over 25 years ago, worked on average fewer days per week (average 1.8 days per week).
- The highest percentage of respondents (45.6%) worked continuously for less than one term in any one school which suggests that the majority of supply cover work is provided for short term absence.
- The EWC will repeat the survey in 2016 and is extending this to learning support staff.

Welsh Government Policy

As outlined above, Wales differs greatly from the rest of the UK, and Welsh Government policy in relation to education is driven by very Wales-specific issues. The Education Workforce Council routinely supplies data to the Welsh Government in order that effective workforce planning can take place and appropriate policies developed to manage supply and demand.

The following observations serve to highlight the differences in Wales:

- In 2005 the Welsh Government commissioned a review of Initial Teacher Training in Wales to advise on how it might more effectively meet the current and likely future needs of schools in Wales. The subsequent report⁸ produced by Professor John Furlong (2006) highlighted a need for a reduction in ITT intakes to match more closely the numbers of newly-qualified teachers required in Wales. Welsh Government Policy has developed in response to this.
- Data held by the EWC illustrates that year on year the number of students on Initial Teacher Education Training (ITET) has decreased. The total number of students in 2002/03 was 2,116 compared with 1,190 for 2015/16. More comprehensive data relating to ITET is available (e.g. by gender, institution, sector etc.) and can be provided upon request.
- Entry criteria to ITET programmes in Wales has also been tightened up to ensure the best calibre of entrants to fully equip them to manage with the demand of a quality-driven education system. Minimum entry requirements are in place for GCSE level English and Mathematics which is a national standard in Wales.

⁸ Review of Initial Teacher Training Provision in Wales: A Report to the Welsh Assembly Government, Professor J. Furlong. Published 2006. Available from: <http://www.education.ox.ac.uk/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2010/07/CE-Report-Annex-A-Review-of-ITT-provision-in-Wales-English.pdf>

- All newly qualified teachers in Wales must hold qualified teacher status and be registered with the Education Workforce Council. Statutory Induction was introduced in September 2003 and applies to all teachers who gain their QTS after 1 April 2003. All registered school teachers (i.e. those working in maintained schools) must hold QTS and be registered with the EWC. Wales does have a small number of independent schools but there are no free schools or academies. This robust regulatory system in Wales ensures that the level of quality is maintained.
- All registrants with the EWC are required to pay a registration fee which is set by Welsh Government. Whilst the fees are modest compared to some equivalent professional registration fees in other sectors, this may act as a disincentive to those in England who are not subject to the same regulation.
- In Wales, as in the rest of the UK, there are issues relating to the recruitment of STEM subject teachers. A recent report by Estyn⁹ (the body responsible for inspecting quality and standards in education and training in Wales), highlights specific concerns around the supply of qualified mathematics teachers and recommended that the Welsh Government take steps to address this.
- It can be said that in general terms, Wales does not have the same level of problems relating teacher recruitment as in England, although it is recognised that there are challenges in Wales relating to the recruitment of head teachers. The National Association of Head Teachers Cymru recently produced a press release¹⁰ detailing challenges, and highlight that this issue is particularly prevalent in the primary sector. Concerns raised included low number of applicants per advertised vacancy, a need to re-advertise posts and issues pertaining to the quality of applicant. The NAHT sent a Freedom of Information request to 22 local authorities in Wales in October 2015 in order to gain an insight into the challenges faced recruiting to leadership roles. The full results were published in February 2016.
- Additionally, there are specific requirements for first time head teachers in Wales which differ from policy in England. In order to practise in Wales, prospective head teachers need to hold the National Professional Qualification for Headship in Wales, be qualified teachers *and* be registered as teachers. There is a suggestion that where vacancies exist, these are being temporarily filled by existing staff, which thus creates a knock on effect of having to backfill the post left vacant.
- It is recognised that in England, particularly in the South, there are issues relating to recruiting teachers due to issues such as the prohibitive cost of housing located close to inner city schools. Whilst it is recognised that there are regional differences in Wales relating to the cost of housing, in very broad terms these issues are not at the same level as those in other parts of the UK. Teachers qualifying in Wales generally want to work in Wales, and low vacancy rates mean that once employed, they are likely to stay where they are.

⁹ Summary of findings from our national thematic reviews for 2015, Published 2016, Estyn. Available from https://www.estyn.gov.wales/sites/default/files/2015%20Remit%20compendium.EN_.pdf

¹⁰ Head teacher crisis looming in Wales, Published February 2016, NAHT Cymru. Available from: <http://www.naht.org.uk/welcome/about-you/your-location/naht-cymru/naht-cymru-news/head-teacher-recruitment-crisis-looming-in-wales/>

- Where there is a demand for shortage subject teachers in Wales, the possibility of encouraging former teachers to return to practise is limited since there is a 5 year limit to re-entry, and those who leave the profession, generally do not return to it.
- There is discussion ongoing relating to the possibility of devolving teacher pay and conditions in Wales. This is one of the few remaining elements of education which still fall under the remit of Westminster. This may have further ramifications for the Wales education workforce should this be implemented, since there are fears highlighted by unions that this could lead to disparity with the rest of the UK and lower pay. There are also concerns that devolution of pay and conditions may impact upon the attractiveness of teaching as a career.
- Wales has completely permeable borders with Scotland and England, which means that if the need should arise, there is a potential to recruit to more difficult to fill vacancies from across the border, however the Welsh Government Policy relating to Welsh language may be a mitigating factor in this respect. A new curriculum for Wales is being developed with education professionals across Wales with the aim of it being available to settings and schools by September 2018. Welsh Language is compulsory up to the age of 16 in Wales which means that there will be a constant demand for a supply of Welsh speaking teachers. With continued demand for If Welsh language ability, and an increasingly distinctive curriculum, it may be difficult to recruit from across the border.
- According to recent reports, there is a rise in the number of English speaking schools overseas which is due to double over coming years. This may further impact upon the general ability to retain teaching staff in the UK. Whilst the comparative salaries overseas may be modest, often overseas postings will come with additional incentives such as free education for children, accommodation and bonuses etc. There is also discussion in the media about catering for those individuals who are planning a career overseas by adding an international dimension to the Initial Teacher Training offering.
- There is polemical debate in relation to the issue of teacher retention and overall job satisfaction across the UK, with sources often citing workload issues, stress and bureaucracy as key issues. There is conflicting evidence in relation to this matter which suggests there is a need to look more deeply into this area to identify any potential geographical trends or issues linked to particular sectors.
- From April 2016, Learning Support Workers have also been required to register with the Education Workforce Council. The register will be further expanded to cover mandatory registration for Work Based Learning and Youth workers from April 2017. Fees for registration are set by Welsh Government. The maintenance of centrally recorded data across a wider set of education practitioners will facilitate a broader analysis of the education workforce and enable more comprehensive trend analysis.
- The Education Workforce Council has been commissioned to undertake a workforce survey of all registrant groups on behalf of Welsh Government which aims to identify key issues within the sector relating to all aspects of teaching. The survey will cover areas such as satisfaction levels, performance and management, professional development, and curriculum and assessment. Analysis will help to identify particular trends. Preliminary findings of this survey will be published early 2017.

Annex A: Number of applicants for QTS from other UK countries and the EEA by year against total registrant population

EEA					
Year	QTS Awarded	Not Awarded	Total Applications	Percentage successful applications for QTS (%)	Total registrant population
2003-04	5	4	9	55.6	37,816
2004-05	0	0	0	N/A	38,220
2005-06	31	15	46	67.4	38,479
2006-07	14	17	31	45.2	38,685
2007-08	20	11	31	64.5	38,942
2008-09	19	17	36	52.8	38,879
2009-10	34	16	50	68.0	38,896
2010-11	27	8	35	77.1	38,770
2011-12	50	14	64	78.1	38,290
2012-13	57	21	78	73.1	37,862
2013-14	65	31	96	67.7	37,673
2014-15	55	21	76	72.4	37,355
2015-16	24	18	42	57.1	36,951
TOTAL	401	193	594		

Northern Ireland					
Year	QTS Awarded	Not Awarded	Total Applications	Percentage successful applications for QTS (%)	Total registrant population
2003-04	1	0	1	100.0	37,816
2004-05	5	0	5	100.0	38,220
2005-06	2	0	2	100.0	38,479
2006-07	0	0	0	N/A	38,685
2007-08	0	1	1	0.0	38,942
2008-09	1	0	1	100.0	38,879
2009-10	2	0	2	100.0	38,896
2010-11	2	0	2	100.0	38,770
2011-12	2	1	3	66.7	38,290
2012-13	0	0	0	N/A	37,862
2013-14	0	0	0	N/A	37,673
2014-15	1	0	1	100.0	37,355
2015-16	0	0	0	N/A	36,951
TOTAL	16	2	18		

Scotland					
Year	QTS Awarded	Not Awarded	Total Applications	Percentage successful applications for QTS (%)	Total registrant population
2003-04	9	3	12	75.0	37,816
2004-05	8	0	8	100.0	38,220
2005-06	5	1	6	83.3	38,479
2006-07	3	1	4	75.0	38,685
2007-08	6	1	7	85.7	38,942
2008-09	9	1	10	90.0	38,879
2009-10	4	1	5	80.0	38,896
2010-11	8	2	10	80.0	38,770
2011-12	7	3	10	70.0	38,290
2012-13	2	1	3	66.7	37,862
2013-14	8	1	9	88.9	37,673
2014-15	3	1	4	75.0	37,355
2015-16	0	0	0	N/A	36,951
TOTAL	72	16	88		

Annex B: Number of teachers registered with the EWC by Ethnicity and National Identity (March 2016)

Number of Teachers registered with the EWC by Ethnic Group	March 2012	March 2013	March 2014	March 2015	March 2016	
	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Number of Teachers	Percentage (%)
Any other ethnic group	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	22	0.1
Asian or Asian British: Any other Asian background	0.1	0	0.1	0	1	0
Asian or Asian British: Bangladeshi	0	0	0	0	3	0
Asian or Asian British: Indian	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	3	0
Asian or Asian British: Pakistani	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	4	0
Black or Black British: African	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	10	0
Black or Black British: Any other Black background	0	0	0	0	0	0
Black or Black British: Caribbean	0	0.1	0.1	0.1	24	0.1
Chinese or Chinese British	0.1	0	0	0	1	0
Mixed: Any other mixed background	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2	0	0
Mixed: White and Asian	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	53	0.1
Mixed: White and Black African	0	0	0.1	0	19	0.1
Mixed: White and Black Caribbean	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	30	0.1
White: Any other White background	18	18	19	19	698	19
White: British	82.4	83.4	84.5	85.6	31926	86.4
I do not wish my ethnic group to be recorded in any way	16	15	14	14	461	12
Unknown	13.4	12.4	11.2	10.1	3,696	10.0
TOTAL	100%	100%	100%	100%	36,951	100%

Number of teachers registered with the EWC by National Identity	March 2012	March 2013	March 2014	March 2015	March 2016	
	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Percentage (%)	Number of Teachers	Percentage (%)
British	23.2	23.2	23.2	23.3	8,538	23.1
English	7.1	6.9	6.8	6.7	2,500	6.8
Irish	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	182	0.5
Scottish	0.4	0.4	0.3	0.3	116	0.3
Welsh	54.5	55.6	56.8	57.8	21,684	58.7
Other	0.9	0.9	1.0	1.0	392	1.1
I do not wish for my national identity to be recorded in any way	0.8	0.8	0.7	0.7	253	0.7
Unknown	12.7	11.7	10.6	9.6	3,286	8.9
TOTAL	100%	100%	100%	100%	36,951	100%